

Appellant alleges that Wicks and Ogot teach away from one another and that one skilled in the art would not be motivated to substitute the Ogot narrow band circular disk ground plane for the Wicks broadband ground plane.

It would have been an obvious matter of design choice to have the symmetrical ground plane is disk shaped, since such a modification would have involved a mere change in the shape of the symmetrical ground plane. A change in shape is generally recognized as being within the level ordinary skill in the art (See MPEP 2144.04 IV B).

For the above reasons, it is believed that the rejections should be sustained.

Respectfully submitted,  
*Shih-Chao Chen*  
Shih-Chao Chen  
Primary Examiner  
Art Unit 2821

SXC  
July 28, 2004

Conferees  
Chaudhuri Olik  
Don Wong  
Shih-Chao Chen  
July 20, 2004

*For Olik Don Wong*  
*Don Wong*  
*Shih-Chao Chen*

Docket Administrator (Room 3J-219)  
Lucent Technologies Inc.  
101 Crawfords Corner Road  
Holmdel, NJ 07733-3030